Nicaragua Solidarity Coalition response to UN Human Rights Report on Nicaragua: Annex 2

Masaya in 2018: A timeline comparison between the UN "Group of Experts" account and actual events

The UN Human Rights Council's report on human rights in Nicaragua relates principally to the violence that occurred in 2018. In the 300-page



full report of the <u>Group of Human Rights Experts on Nicaragua</u>, the group ("GHREN") uses the violence in **Masaya** in April-July of that year as one of two case studies. They choose Masaya (and another, shorter, case study) because it "exemplifies the continuity and systematic nature of the attacks against demonstrators and the civilian population in general" (p.100 of the report). In nine pages, the report sets out a timeline of events in Masaya which the GHREN considers part of the justification for the conclusions it reaches about the violence in 2018.

However, the GHREN's account omits a large number of very significant incidents in Masaya during this period, that <u>do not</u> support their conclusions. Among these are:

- Considerable evidence of use of conventional firearms by the opposition, including in systematic attacks on the police station which put it under siege for several weeks.
- Many examples of attacks by the opposition on the ordinary population and on Sandinista sympathizers, including murder, torture, kidnapping, burning of public buildings and ordinary homes, and destruction and looting of large numbers of businesses.
- Incidents which show the clear involvement of the Catholic church and one of the "human rights" organizations in collaborating with the opposition.
- Many failed attempts at local peace negotiations which were breached by the opposition.
- Attempts by ordinary people to resist the opposition's violence and remove the roadblocks.

To demonstrate that the report's account of events is far from complete and does not support its conclusions, here we compare the GHREN account with that of this author, who lived through this period in Masaya and has also carefully studied multiple sources of evidence about it. The timeline (below) makes a side-by-side comparison of the GHREN version of events and what actually happened. Against each date it shows relevant points (summarized or quoted) from the GHREN case study and our account of events.

Our account is taken from several sources:

- 1. material from the diary of a resident of Masaya during the period, the journalist John Perry (marked "JP")
- 2. media reports (links shown where possible)
- 3. reports of the National Assembly's *Comision de Verdad, Justica y Paz* ("CVJP"), which are also referenced by the GHREN.
- 4. Government evidence <u>submitted to the OAS</u> on June 18 (referred to as "GRUN").
- 5. <u>Dismissing the Truth</u> ("DtT"), a report answering Amnesty International's second report on Nicaragua 2018, which also has a timeline of events in Masaya, and appears not to have been taken into account by the GHREN.
- 6. Some references to reports of the Inter-American Commission on Human Rights ("CIDH", for its initials in Spanish).

Some parts of our account rely on reported conversations with police and residents and on pro-Sandinista media. These often contradict the GHREN's own evidence, based as it is largely on interviews with opposition sources and on opposition-supporting media.

Dates	UN "Group of Experts" (GHREN)	What really happened in Masaya	
Apr 18 – July 17	"The case of the city of Masaya is exemplary of how repression against the civilian population has been perpetrated in a constant and disproportionate manner, causing since then the death of numerous civilian victims over 89 days." Deaths: CIDH/GHREN = 29 or 30 over the period	CVJP count 39 deaths (Aug 2018), later reduced to 35 deaths (July 2019), including three police officers. Two more police officers were killed after the period in question in a staged opposition attack (i.e. five police fatalities in total). Of the 35 deaths, while the majority appear to be those involved in opposition attacks, several are bystanders or progovernment, as noted below. Of the 418 police officers injured nationally, 99 were injured in Masaya (CVJP). The injuries mainly resulted from gunfire and/or attacks by explosive missiles such as contact bombs, according to discussions with police (JP).	
April 18	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	The first violent confrontation occurs in Monimbó between opposition and Sandinista youth. Opposition leader Dora Maria Tellez is seen providing supplies and paying money to opposition assailants (verbal report to JP from Masaya police, consistent with evidence regarding subsequent events). A receipt in her name, dated April 18 2018, was later CENTRO DE MYESTIGACIONES DE LA CONTINICACION CONTROLAGORISM NAME AND ADDRESS OF THE ADDRESS O	e ad or
April 19	"As in the rest of the country, the population of Masaya mobilized on April 19 in protest against the INSS reform." A "pacific" march took place, heading towards the INSS offices, which was stopped by police: 3 people injured.	reinforce civil society in Nicaragua." "The population" was a minority. For example, on this day a group of people stood peacefully outside the INSS office to protect it from possible attack by the marchers and to support the reforms, fearing opposition vandals would wreck the office and prevent them from receiving their pensions. (There were later several other instances of people protecting buildings, e.g. the PALI supermarket, some successful and others not (JP)). Attacks were made by opposition criminals on a mobile healt clinic and on the main secondary school.	ort e
April 20	Opposition destroys historic <i>Comandito</i> in Monimbó; then begins a "pacific" march towards	Opposition destroys historic <i>Comandito</i> in Monimbó then provokes violence with young Sandinistas; both sides had homemade weapons. Opposition later attack police who respond with gunfire.	

Dates	UN "Group of Experts" (GHREN)	What really happened in Masaya
	the Central Park. Later, 4 people were killed	Three deaths: Jairo Mauricio Hernandez, Álvaro Alberto Gómez Montalvan and José Abraham Amador, all apparently protesters (CVJP).
April 21	One death; 13 people reported injured in the hospital, two with gunshot wounds	One death: Carlos Manuel Sandino Hernández, apparent victim of crossfire (GRUN/CVJP). The GHREN accepts that injured protesters were treated in hospital, but they later omit this type of observation in their summary arguments, claiming that protesters were denied medical care. Just in four days, April 19-22, four police officers were injured
April 20 onwards	"The inhabitants of Masaya erected barricades throughout the city as a form of protest against the repression suffered and, according to testimonies and press reports, as a form of protection and self-defense."	in Masaya <u>out of 121 injured</u> and two killed, nationally. Tranques (roadblocks) were erected by the opposition, often against the wishes of inhabitants. In one barrio, La Reforma, barricades were erected by the community <u>to keep out</u> the opposition (JP). There were repeated conflicts over the erection of tranques: local people trying to dismantle them, municipal workers trying to repair roads, opposition criminals threatening residents and workers (JP). Reynaldo Urbina <u>explained</u> how the opposition enticed young people with money and drugs to man the tranques. In Masaya, it was repeatedly reported that the payment was C\$500 per night. Tranqueros (those guarding the tranques) were brought into the city by lorry if they came from outlying
April 20 onwards	"because of the fear generated by the presence of elements of armed pro-government groups in public hospitals, medical and nursing students organized medical posts in different parts of the city to attend to injured demonstrators."	areas (witnessed by JP). Opposition groups set up medical centers staffed by people who in some cases left their posts in the hospital. However, the hospital and staff issued a notice on May 23 assuring that everyone would be treated at the hospital. The issue was how to get to the hospital given the blocking of roads, which badly affected people needing urgent treatment. See note below in the case of an injured police officer, who died as a result.
April 23	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	12 opposition criminals arrested by police <u>are freed</u> at request of the Catholic church, on promise of good behavior.
May 4	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	Market traders organized among themselves to protect the main Masaya market from attack by opposition criminals; they called for peace. At one stage, to protect the market from opposition attack, traders set up their own vigilante system and allowed entry only women customers (JP).

Dates	UN "Group of Experts" (GHREN)	What really happened in Masaya
May 6	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	A peaceful and unarmed motor "caravan" tours Masaya with people holding up signs calling for peace (photo); it was attacked by the opposition using a hail of stones and mortar fire when it reached Monimbó, with vehicles trying to prevent those attacked from escaping (JP).
May 11	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	Office of the Sandinista Party in Masaya is <u>ransacked</u> by opposition criminals.
May 12	Town hall workers attempt to remove tranques in San Miguel, resulting in confrontation and two deaths	In fact, residents began to take down tranques, and replace the street pavement blocks that had been dug up to make them, over a period of the next several days (photo). But they were often prevented from doing so and threatened by the opposition, or the opposition reinstated the tranques.
May 12	Two people die, killed by police	Two people die, one caught in crossfire and the other because he was working in the artisan market when it was ransacked by protesters (CVJP). This was the result of a violent confrontation between opposition and police on the night of May 11 which continued into the following day. Alba Luz Valverde, owner of a small business, later testified to the CIDH that her business was destroyed by opposition criminals on May 12 and she was falsely proclaimed "dead" in social media, supposedly from gunfire.
May 12	" some demonstrators in the city of Masaya made use of stones, as well as homemade weapons including slingshots, mortars and contact bombs whose manufacture was perfected throughout the protest. Testimony indicates that in later phases of the protest a few people were in possession of firearms, including hunting	ESCENAS DONDE SE COMETÍAN LOS CRÍMENES Terroristas con armas de fuego industriales, en tranques de Masaya Jojney Paveda

Dates	UN "Group of Experts" (GHREN)	What really happened in Masaya	
	shotguns and revolvers. On May 12, protesters reportedly recovered an M16 A1 assault rifle during clashes with militarized pro- government armed groups."	"It can be seen from the above and from evidence that the police were confronting many cases had conventional weapons arout several murders and armed attacks in others had been injured, often severely."	g protesters who in nd who had carried n which police and
May 12	[Apart from the destruction of the Comandito, see above, the GHERN makes no mention of other damage to property in Masaya until June 19]	A day of intense destruction in Masaya. T down the town hall and the mayor's brot They ransack the local office of the Sandin to loot shops, stealing TVs, motor bikes, e Radio Shack and La Curacao.	her's house (photo). nista Party and start
May 12 onwards	[None of this is mentioned by GHERN.]	Despite a 'truce' at national level as part of between government and opposition, produced Masaya police station. At this point, police the police station, under orders not to reduce the police station with roadblocks. The police escape nor receive supplies. Nightly attack began to take place, using rifles, contact is weapons as well as specially built, large, reduced including the attacks on the police and the clearly shows the use of both conventions.	otesters attacked the e were confined to turn fire (GRUN). and surrounded the could then neither iks on the police bombs and other makeshift mortars. of this period, e weapons used. It

Dates	UN "Group of Experts" (GHREN)	What really happened in Masaya
	(GIIILLIV)	weapons (confirmed by JP via conversations with various Masaya police including General Avellán).
		During the whole of the five-week period beginning on May 12, practically all banks, public buildings, schools and shops across the city were closed if they had not already been ransacked. Most businesses closed and people were without work. Within the city of Masaya, vehicle traffic was paralyzed by the presence of the <i>tranques</i> , which were only lifted to allow opposition vehicles through (JP).
May 13 onwards	[None of this is mentioned by GHERN.]	Opposition groups attack and set fire to the tourist market, the main secondary school, the prosecutor's office and other buildings and private homes (JP).
		Photos show a protester with a high calibre weapon in front of the Don Bosco school in Monimbo, part of the area totally controlled by the opposition.
May 15	[None of this is	The Restaurante El Paraje is <u>ransacked and looted</u> by the
	mentioned by GHERN.]	opposition.
May 15- June 19 (five weeks)	From pp. 80-81: "The GHREN also identified that, in some cases, criminal practices took place in the context of the roadblocks, including improper toll collection, acts of harassment, robbery, and even illegal detentions or kidnappings."	At the roadblocks, hooded and armed 'protesters' could demand to see identity papers, search bags and intimidate or threaten people or refuse them passage. Armed groups went from house to house at night-time, threatening occupants and stealing from them (JP). There were repeated instances of commercial vehicles either being refused entry to Masaya or being charged a "toll" or multiple "tolls" as they passed through roadblocks on the surrounding main roads, many unable to sell produce they were attempting to take to the Masaya market.
May 17	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	On May 17, different community groups met with the police and agreed to work together to restore order in the city (photo), except for Monimbo (where no agreement was possible).

Dates	UN "Group of Experts" (GHREN)	What really happened in Masaya
May 26	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	Families, including children, work to dismantle tranques and repair roads in Masaya.
May 28	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	Another attack on the police station, vehicles damaged, no response by police under the agreement at the national dialogue (GRUN). Public prosecutor's office destroyed by fire (photo). Ten businesses looted, including jewellery shops, etc. (GRUN). As normally happened, the opposition press blamed "Sandinista mobs" for the arson attacks.
May 29	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	The tourist market was again attacked and many shops destroyed. This is the nationally famous artisan market that plays an important role in support of local artisans, commerce and tourism, attracting (for example) visiting tourists from cruise ships that stop in Nicaraguan ports.
May 30	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	Opposition criminals attacked and robbed a health service truck carrying supplies to the hospital (GRUN). Those manning a <i>tranque</i> in Niquinohomo <u>capture a bus</u> to use it to block the road. Four people were injured, 32 passengers left overnight without transport (to Rivas) (GRUN).
May 30	Death caused by a sharpshooter	Death of Carlos Manuel Vásquez, from unknown causes (apparently was not a protester) (CVJP). Followed a night of attacks from 9.00pm to 4.00am on the police station, in which the police were still confined (GRUN). Destruction of businesses continues.
May 31	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	Masaya Family Court was burned and all files destroyed, affecting adoption proceedings and many family legal issues.

Dates	UN "Group of Experts" (GHREN)	What really happened in Masaya
June 1	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	An attack on the head of the health service in Masaya, Dr Silvio Navarro: his vehicle was burnt, his house surrounded and he and his family assaulted and threatened. Armed men destroy the BANPRO cash machine and steal the equivalent of US\$ 7,878.
June 2-3	"At the beginning of June demonstrators were controlling the city on all four sides, while a group of between 20 and 30 members of the National Police remained in the police headquarters in Masaya and within a perimeter marked on one side by the old handicrafts market and on the other by the Humberto Alvarado school."	Seven people killed at <i>tranques</i> , near the police station, or in the market, all apparently opposition fighters (CVJP). Nightly attacks on the police station continue (DtT). Eleven protesters are arrested, all with criminal records, and as well as homemade weapons they carried between them six firearms (4 shotguns, 12 gauge and 2 revolvers, 38 gauge). A police officer, José Abraham Martínez, was killed. He was shot in the eye, the opposition wouldn't allow him past the <i>tranques</i> to go to hospital, and he was dead when he eventually arrived (DtT). Opposition criminals tried to steal his body to burn it but doctors hid the body. Another officer, Marlon Gerardo García Gómez, received two serious gunshot wounds.
	Violence builds again, nine people killed, in barrio S Miguel and in the artisan market (both near the police station). Attacks on the police station result in one death and 8 police injured; 21 people were arrested but later released by agreement with the Catholic church.	Two attempts were made to burn down the main Masaya secondary school, which serves 3,600 pupils and which backs onto the police station, so as to get access to it (DtT). By this stage the tourist market had twice been set on fire. The Restaurante Che Gris was destroyed (photo). General Avellán reported that a meeting with the opposition, called by the Catholic church, reached various agreements but that they had already been broken.

Dates	UN "Group of Experts" (GHREN)	What really happened in Masaya
June 3	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	The house of a senior doctor at the Masaya hospital, Dr Alejandra Ortega, is burnt down (photo).
June 6, 9, 17	Two killed in attacks by police on tranques, one by a (supposed police) sharpshooter. More attacks on the police station (June 9) in which three police are injured.	Two killed at <i>tranques</i> , one in crossfire. One (June 6) is Jorge René Zepeda Carrión, apparently manning a <i>tranque</i> when hit in an attack by rival opposition members (CVJP). Attacks on police station continue (JP).
June 12	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	Luis Alberto Gaitán Zeledón, an official at the airport, and another man, were kidnapped, beaten stripped and robbed by the opposition in a Masaya park.
June 12	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	Around 200 armed opposition members attack and destroy the municipal depot and vehicles used to collect the city's rubbish (see photo).
		They kidnapped ten workers and held them for several hours while they were badly beaten. Two security staff are tortured: one has severe damage to the skull, the other has his arm smashed so violently that it later has to be amputated. The latter is taken to see Alvaro Leiva of "human rights" group ANPDH who is clearly working with the opposition. He is also taken to a Catholic church priest's house, from which he later escapes. Their testimony is here .

Dates	UN "Group of Experts" (GHREN)	What really happened in Masaya
		The photo, posted on social media by their captors, shows the victims Roberto Jose Raydez Garcia and Reynaldo Jose Urbina Cuadra. They were tortured because they would not reveal the whereabouts of the mayor of Masaya, whom the attackers wanted to assassinate.
June 13	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	Several more public buildings are <u>destroyed</u> by the opposition, including one of the <i>casas maternas</i> which assist pregnant women.
June 15	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	Health ministry office in Masaya <u>attacked</u> and ransacked for the second time.
June 18	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	Armed protesters led by Yubrank Suazo declared a five-member 'junta of national salvation' (photo) to administer Masaya and said they no longer recognized the Ortega government (DtT).
June 19	"In the early morning of June 19, members of the National Police DOEP carried out an operation to extract Commissioner Avellán, who had been held in the Masaya National Police barracks since June 2." Three died at tranques, one who was injured died later. Curfew imposed in the northern part of Masaya. The CSE office in Masaya was ransacked.	The relief operation which took place was to clear the north side of Masaya. Three deaths occurred (no police injured) (CVJP). [NB the GHREN report implicitly acknowledges that police had been unable to leave the police station for 17 days – in practice it was longer.] As a result, after June 19 the north side of Masaya was free of tranques and shops and businesses began to reopen (JP). People began to help restore the streets (photo).

Dates	UN "Group of Experts" (GHREN)	What really happened in Masaya
June 21	More deaths (either two or three)	A Catholic delegation, including Cardenal Brenes and the Papal Nuncio, came to Masaya. They visited roadblocks in Monimbó and met police chief General Avellan (photo). During the meeting, an explosive landed in the police station, almost hitting the delegation; one of the delegation members made a phone call to ask the protesters to stop firing, which they did immediately. The members of the delegation apparently had the power to stop the violence with a simple phone call, thus making clear the close links between the church and the opposition leaders.
June 23	Municipal worker killed, impression given that it was in crossfire	There were two deaths, one in crossfire (CVJP). Carolina de los Ángeles Collado Delgadillo, a municipal worker in Masaya was killed by opposition gunfire while repairing roads on the north side of the city damaged by the building of roadblocks. As in many other cases, she was presented in the right-wing media as a victim of police – rather than opposition – violence.
June 25	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	The Hermanos de Japon School was <u>ransacked and destroyed</u> , and teachers and staff threatened. This was one of the best-equipped schools in Masaya and served 682 students.
June 27	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	Residents <u>help municipal workers</u> in the northern part of Masaya to clean and repair the streets.
July 1	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	Leaders of gangs operating the roadblocks publicly signed agreements with the police and the Masaya mayor, to remove them. However, these were immediately denounced as having no validity by Yubrank Suazo and other opposition leaders.

Dates	UN "Group of Experts" (GHREN)	What really happened in Masaya
		The signed agreements (one page shown in the photo) reveal clearly how several different gangs, with names such as Los Tamales, Los Porroncones, Los Mañas, etc., all well-known local gangs with criminal reputations, were heavily involved in running the roadblocks. The signed agreements (one page shown in the photo) reveal clearly how several different gangs, with names such as Los Tamales, Los Porroncones, Los Mañas, etc., all well-known local gangs with criminal reputations, were heavily involved in running the roadblocks.
July 7	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	Opposition leader Yubrank Suazo, who was armed with a conventional weapon, led a group which attacked the house of Erik Alonso in Monimbó, using firearms, mortars and contact bombs.
July 9	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	Residents in the northern part of Masaya celebrate the return of peaceful conditions, with hundreds taking part in a march.
July 11	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	In Nindiri, police <u>captured three men</u> in a Mazda, no. CZ13224. They were transporting military-style weapons from the Managua Cathedral to Monimbó for use in the <i>tranques</i> .
July 12	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	Police officer Rodrigo Alfredo Barrios Flores was kidnapped and tortured (photo). He managed to escape his captors three days later.
		SECURISTRO, EN PERLUNCIO DEL POLICIA RODRISCO AL FREDO SARRIOS FLORES. 12: de julio 2018. 13: de julio 2018. Suporicio Distribre Predio. Securistrosio y turburudo partemoristario dependo province.

Dates	UN "Group of Experts"	What really happened in Masaya
July 14- 15	"On July 15, the death of a lieutenant of the Anti-Narcotics Inspection Unit of the National Police occurred, according to official sources, at the Las Flores junction, on the road to Catarina." Three other deaths.	Unarmed, off-duty police officer Gabriel de Jesús Vado Ruíz was kidnapped, tortured and, on the second day, killed. Vado was 22, was married to another young police officer and they both worked with youth as community-based officers. His kidnappers were roadblock operators who discovered his uniform in his backpack. Before he died, he was tied up and dragged behind a pick-up truck. His body was literally burned to a pulp at one of the roadblocks (photo). A Catholic priest, Harvin Padilla, was accused of complicity in the crime because he was aware of it and was recorded saying that photos and videos should not be published because of the bad image they would create. He also directed them to put the body in a latrine. Later in the day, another priest, Edwin Roman, with human rights worker Alvaro Leiva of ANPDH, then attempted to remove the corpse, to hide the crime (photo). Vado's wife subsequently talked about how news of his death had been manipulated by opposition media.
July 17	"The attack [to relieve the south side of Masaya] began in the early hours of the morning and came from all sides at the entrance to the neighborhood of Monimbó." Five deaths, including a police officer.	As the GHREN acknowledges, the south side of Masaya had a large concentration of <i>tranques</i> , manned by people with arrays of both homemade and conventional weapons. Some were reinforced with deep tranches dug in the road. A massive exercise was therefore needed to retake control of the city as effectively as possible while minimizing casualties. As DtT points out: "The police in Nicaragua do not routinely carry heavy weapons, they do not have armored vehicles, and their numbers were insufficient to handle the scale of the uprising that took place. Nor for political reasons could the army be deployed. There was good reason to use volunteers in what was in effect an emergency situation, especially in the worst of the opposition violence in places such as Masaya and Jinotepe."

Dates	UN "Group of Experts"	What really happened in Masaya			
	(GHREN)				
		DtT continues: "Large numbers of armed police and volunteer police entered the south side of Masaya on July 17 and regained control of Monimbó and the rest of this side of the city. Given the extent of the roadblocks, the quantity of arms including automatic weapons held by those manning them, and the history of attacks on the police and the population in general, the police operation was highly restrained."			
		The operation resulted in only three deaths (according to the CVJP), one of whom was a police officer (Kelvin Javier Rivera Laínez, who died from a gunshot wound). This was because the police/volunteer police were ordered to minimize casualties (JP – conversation with one of the volunteer police). "It was clear that, given that the army itself had not been deployed by the government at any stage, the police themselves would not have been able to conduct this operation successfully without the massive logistical support from the volunteer police." (DtT)			
After	[no equivalent in the	About 120 arrests were made on July 17, but 80 were then			
July 17	GHREN report]	released to their families after signing good behavior agreements, even where they had destroyed public property or used makeshift mortars. Those detained were leaders Yubrank Suazo, María Peralta and Cristhian Fajardo and others, accused either of leading the insurrection in Masaya, being involved in financing the roadblocks or accused of murder or other crimes of violence. A huge clear-up operation began on and after July 17, to repair roads and restore traffic circulation. This also required the removal of booby-trap bombs left in certain roads. They were also left in the rural escape routes used by those who fled the <i>tranques</i> , to injure anyone following them, and of course (until removed) were dangerous for anyone later using the same routes.			
After July 17	[no equivalent in the GHREN report]	In a report by Jorge Ramos from October 2018 which generally sought to glorify criminals who were never granted asylum in Costa Rica, the perpetrators (e.g. "Burro", see photo) admitted that they used firearms: "They talk about giving up the use of makeshift weapons in favour of using powerful modern weapons. This is only the most specific of dozens of videos and photos which show how conventional weapons spread rapidly around the Masaya roadblocks, especially those on the main roads around the edges of the city and leading to Managua." (DtT)			